

Evaluation of the Tofu Craftsman Small and Medium Industry Development Program in Serang City, Banten 2020

¹ Leo Agustino, ² Cynthia Utami Damayanti, ³ Jonah Silas, ⁴M. Agus Yusoff

^{1&2} *Departement of Public Administration, Faculty of Social and Political Science, Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa University, Serang, Indonesia.*

³ *Indonesian Politics Research and Consulting, Bandung, Indonesia*

⁴ *Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities, Univeristi Kebangsaan Malaysia*

email: ¹leo.agustino@untirta.ac.id, ²6661190098@untirta.ac.id, ³jonah@iprc.co.id, ⁴agus@ukm.my

ARTICLE INFORMATION

ABSTRACT

Article history :

Submit :

15-06-2023

First Revision:

19-06-2023

Accept Submission :

28-06-2023

Keywords :

Small and Medium Industry Development, Program Evaluation, CIPP

This research focuses on the tofu industry sector development program in Lopang Village. One of the problems studied in this study is that the DinkopUKMPerindag of Serang City does not provide information to tofu craftsmen about the training that will be held. This research aims to evaluate the Small and Medium Industry Development Program (Case Study of Tofu Craftsmen in Lopang Village) using the CIPP theory by Daniel Stufflebeam. This research uses descriptive qualitative methods by analyzing the results of interviews, observations, interviews, documentation and document studies. The results of this study indicate that the SMI development program case study of Tofu Craftsmen in Lopang Village has not fully run well. The evaluation includes i) context, the program does not solve the problem according to the needs of tofu craftsmen; ii) input, mentoring activities are still carried out accidentally; iii) process, there are still some obstacles, iv) product, it has not achieved the program objectives of improving the quality and quantity of tofu products.

© The Author(s)



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International License.

A. INTRODUCTION

National development is an effort to improve the quality of Indonesian people and society which is carried out sustainably and based on national capabilities by utilizing advances in technology and science. It includes a variety of aspects of the life of the nation. The main actor of development is the community, while the government must build a conducive climate to support national development. The role of the community in national development, especially in economic development, is the Small and Medium Industries (SMI).

SMI is one of the mainstays of the government in building employment opportunities, particularly in the post-crisis era. SMI sector plays an important role in the Indonesian economy, especially in absorbing a large number of workers. In 2022, the number of SMI will reach 4.4 million business units

or a majority of 99.7 per cent of industrial business units in Indonesia. In addition, their contribution to the growth of the Gross Regional Domestic Product (GRDP) is very large in state and regional income.

Table 1
GRDP Distribution of Indonesian Small and Medium Industries

Island	Years										
	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020
Sumatra	18,42	18,5	18,7	18,69	18,59	18,5	18,5	18,33	18,05	18,12	18,59
Java	69,89	70,1	70,4	70,58	70,76	70,8	70,7	70,87	70,93	70,81	69,93
Bali	0,39	0,37	0,38	0,39	0,4	0,41	0,41	0,39	0,39	0,39	0,38
Nusa	0,22	0,22	0,22	0,22	0,21	0,21	0,21	0,21	0,21	0,21	0,21
Borneo	7,79	7,32	6,91	6,65	6,47	6,39	6,34	6,25	6,05	5,96	5,98
Celebes	2,25	2,45	2,38	2,43	2,52	2,72	2,87	2,93	3,36	3,54	3,87
Moluccas	0,11	0,11	0,11	0,11	0,11	0,11	0,12	0,13	0,14	0,14	0,18
Papua	0,92	0,95	0,93	0,94	0,92	0,91	0,89	0,87	0,88	0,83	0,86

Source: Maharani (2022)

Based on SMI's very large role in supporting a country's economy, its development concerns the government. To realize the development of SMIs, the Serang City Government has enacted Serang City Regional Regulation Number 3 of 2015 concerning the Empowerment and Development of Micro Enterprises (SMEs). The facilitation of business development in question is in the fields of 1) production and processing; 2) marketing; 3) human resources; 4) micro business management; and 5) design and technology. With the existence of this regional regulation, it is hoped that it can provide legal certainty in empowering and developing SMEs in Serang City.

Serang City is the Capital City of Banten Province, where all government activities are located in one area, namely the Central Government Area of Banten Province. The city of Serang is located close to the entrance and exit from Java Island to Sumatra Island, the potential for developing capital-intensive and large-scale industrial areas in the Cilegon City area, as well as the potential for large-scale businesses in Tangerang and its surroundings. This means that Serang City has the potential to become a centre for the exchange of goods and services for the surrounding growth points. The current development of settlements in Serang City is the influence of economic development at these growth points, which can be an indication of the possibility of growth in the SMI sector.

Table 2
Recapitulation of Types of Business Sectors in Serang City in 2022

No.	Decription	Recapitulation
1	Agriculture and mining	891
2	Processing industry	997
3	Electricity, gas, and water	98
4	Construction	472
5	Trade and retail	10,891
6	Acommodation, food, and beverage	690
7	Transportation, warehouse, and communication	107
8	Financial intermediary	179
9	Real estate and leasing business	168
10	Education service	-
11	Health service and social activity	115
12	Social service, socio-cultural, entertainment and other individuals	-

13	Individual home service	172
Total		14,780

Source: obtained by the researcher (2022)

The emphasis of this research is on processing industry, as its players can produce competitive goods with high added value and are highly demanded by domestic and foreign costumers (Sulistiyo & Putra, 2020). One of the potential commodities in this branch of the processing industry is tofu, this is because consumers know very broadly, covering all social strata. One of the biggest tofu industries in Serang City is the tofu industry in Lopang Village, Serang District.

Table 3
Average Weekly Per Capita Consumption According to Processed Food and Beverage Groups Per Regency/City (Commodity Unit)

REGENCY/CITY	The Average of Weekly Per Capita Consumption of Foods and Beverages in City/Regency (Comodity Unit)					
	Breads	Fries (tofu, tempe, bakwan, banana)	Rice	Iced beverages	Meatball and noodle	Snacks
	2022	2022	2022	2022	2022	2022
PANDEGLANG REGENCY	0.989	2.847	0.349	0.443	0.526	0.945
LEBAK REGENCY	1.552	3.625	0.471	0.726	0.861	1.118
TANGERANG REGENCY	1.234	3.306	1.371	0.803	0.681	0.625
SERANG REGENCY	1.506	3.675	0.889	1.049	0.815	0.841
TANGERANG CITY	0.873	1.950	0.866	0.502	0.604	0.599
CILEGON CITY	1.337	3.121	0.734	1.251	0.762	0.973
SERANG CITY	1.627	4.064	1.075	1.372	0.854	0.754
SOUTH TANGERANG CITY	0.903	1.956	0.576	0.281	0.547	0.490

Source: Obtained By Researcher: 2022

Table 3 shows the average consumption per capita per week according to the processed food and beverage group per regency/city is dominated by fried foods such as tofu, tempeh, bakwan and bananas. This number is above the consumption value of bread, rice and noodles. The area with the highest consumption of fried food in Banten Province is Serang City.

Table 4
Average Weekly Per Capita Consumption by Legumes Group Per Regency/City (Commodity Unit)

NAMA KABUPATEN/ KOTA	Kacang tanah tanpa kulit		Kacang kedelai		Kacang lainnya		Tahu		Tempe		Oncom	
	2021	2022	2021	2022	2021	2022	2021	2022	2021	2022	2021	2022
PANDEGLANG REGENCY	0.002	0.001	0.000	0.000	0.001	0.001	0.107	0.098	0.136	0.142	0.096	0.132
LEBAK REGENCY	0.009	0.011	0.003	0.005	0.004	0.001	0.128	0.131	0.151	0.148	0.087	0.091
TANGERANG REGENCY	0.002	0.005	0.000	0.001	0.001	0.002	0.144	0.140	0.156	0.143	0.075	0.105
SERANG REGENCY	0.003	0.002	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.119	0.156	0.187	0.231	0.079	0.098
TANGERANG CITY	0.004	0.007	0.000	0.001	0.002	0.001	0.180	0.179	0.202	0.180	0.131	0.121
CILEGON CITY	0.003	0.004	-	-	0.002	0.004	0.180	0.171	0.197	0.183	0.060	0.061
SERANG CITY	0.000	0.004	-	0.001	0.003	0.001	0.170	0.186	0.248	0.228	0.063	0.067
SOUTH TANGERANG CITY	0.005	0.002	0.001	0.001	0.001	0.001	0.184	0.160	0.169	0.166	0.063	0.068

Source: Obtained by Researcher, 2022

As previously explained in the narrative in table 1.4 that know includes social strata, the researchers found secondary data which was shown by the Central Bureau of Statistics (2022). Table 1.5 shows that the average per capita consumption per week according to the legume group is dominated by tempeh and tofu. However, consumption of tofu increased by 16 points, from 0.170 in 2021 to 0.186 in 2022. Meanwhile, consumption of tempeh decreased by 20 points, from 0.248 in 2021 to 0.228 in 2022.

Table 5
Distribution of Tofu Craftsmen in Serang City in 2022

NO.	DISTRICT	NEIGHBORHOODS	TOTAL PER SUB-DISTRICT
1	Serang	Lopang	35
		Cimuncang	3
		Kaligandu	1
2	Walantaka	Cigoong	4
		Pipitan	1
3	Curug	Curug Manis	3
		Curug	1
4	Cipocok Jaya	Karundang	3
		Cipocok	1
5	Kasemen		-
6	Taktakan		-
TOTAL			52

Source: Dinas Koperasi, UKM, Perindustrian dan Perdagangan Kota Serang (2022)

Based on table 6, shows that the location where there are the most tofu craftsmen in Serang City is Lopang Village with a total of 35 tofu producers. The tofu industry in Lopang Village has the potential to be developed into one of the informal sectors which helps the local government's role in absorbing labor and increasing Regional Original Income. The following is a table of tofu micro industries that have been upgraded to become small industries.

Tabel 6
Small Industry Data in Serang City in 2022

NO.	IKM NAME	OWNER NAME	TOTAL OF EMPLOYEES		OMSET	
			2016	2022	2016	2022
1.	Tahu Bandung Pak Rahmat	Rahmat	-	11	-	Rp2.880.000.000
2.	FR Tahu	Ratna Kesuma	10	10	Rp1,440,000,000	Rp2.000.000.000
3.	Source Rizki Barokah	Ujang Elon	4	18	Rp360,000,000	Rp.3.960.000.000
4.	Tahu Bandung Pak Jajang	Jajang Abdurohlim	4	16	Rp324,000,000	Rp5.040.000.000
5.	Tahu Bandung Pak Suhanda	Suhanda	4	16	Rp6.000.000	Rp5.400.000.000

Source: Dinas Koperasi, UKM, Perindustrian dan Perdagangan Kota Serang (2022)

Based on the data above, it is explained that five tofu industries have succeeded in upgrading to small industries. This means that the tofu industry has the potential to generate a large turnover so that it can boost the regional economy. This is quite encouraging because 15% of the total number of small industries is dominated by small tofu industries.

The SMI development program implemented by the Office of Cooperatives, SMEs, Industry and Trade (DinkopUKMPerindag) of Serang City aims to increase the commodities of SMI actors both in terms of quality and quantity. In implementing the Small and Medium Industry Development program there is no time limit, where every year the implementing agency always monitors and evaluates micro business actors, especially tofu craftsmen in Lopang Village by conducting data collection, although not all tofu craftsmen receive industrial development in the form of training and mentoring.

This program consists of several activities, namely food training, halal certification training and mentoring. First, food training aims to provide information and additional knowledge to Small and Medium Industry (SMI) actors regarding the quality of food products. The importance of the quality of food products in the food processing industry is expected to minimize the health risks associated with the consumption of food products.

Second, halal certification training is carried out to facilitate halal certification for SMI. Since 2019, halal certification has become mandatory for processed food and beverages to circulate on the market. With the implementation of this activity, it is expected that SMI can more easily process halal certification so that it can expand its market share.

As for the assistance carried out, it aims to convey information regarding various policies and incentives from the government, as well as presenting ideas, and information regarding market developments. Field assistants visited each centre and discussed the problems and constraints experienced by SMEs. In addition, the accompanying staff also communicates with the tofu craftsmen online, namely via WhatsApp short messages. Briefly, here is the activity table:

Tabel 7
Types of SMI Development Program Activities

No.	Activity Name	Activity Objectives	Goal	Implementation Time
1.	Pelatihan Makanan	Meningkatnya pengetahuan IKM mengenai mutu produk makanan	50	06-07 Oktober 2022
2.	Pelatihan Sertifikat Halal	Terfasilitasinya sertifikasi halal bagi IKM	35	20 Oktober 2022

Source: Dinas Koperasi, UKM, Perindustrian dan Perdagangan Kota Serang (2022)

In the implementation of the Small and Medium Industry Development program, there is no time limit, where every year the implementing agency always monitors and evaluates micro business actors, especially tofu craftsmen in Lopang Village by carrying out data collection, although not all tofu craftsmen receive industrial development in the form of training and mentoring. Not to mention, the fluctuating price of imported soybeans, causes tofu craftsmen in the Lopang Village, Serang City to be prone to problems in developing their business.

The government has formed cooperatives as an effort to develop SMI centers which were updated in the Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 17 of 2012 concerning cooperatives. The establishment of KOPTI in Serang City has the aim of accommodating all the aspirations of tempe and tofu producers and becoming a forum for the development of the tempe and tofu industry in addition to running its business as a supplier of soybeans to meet the production needs of members of tempe and tofu producers. Then, in practice, it aims to develop the tempe and tofu industry both in terms of marketing and ease of market access and product promotion.

Based on the results of the researcher's initial observations and then meeting with the DinkopUKMPerindag City of Serang, he said that in the development of the tofu industry in the Lopang Village there are still obstacles which in terms of the quality of human resources for tofu craftsmen are still low and the low growth of the tofu industry is heavily influenced by fluctuations in soybean prices. The researcher chose this research topic because based on the results of the above observations it can be seen that the potential of the tofu processing industry in Lopang Village has not been optimally exploited.

Furthermore, the researchers found that in the Implementation of the Small and Medium Industry Development Program in 2022 (Case Study of Tofu Craftsmen in Lopang Village, Serang District, Serang City) there were still several obstacles, namely: First, the lack of desire of tofu craftsmen to take part in training held by the DinkopUKMPerindag City of Serang. Based on initial observations and later meeting with one of the children of tofu craftsmen named Mrs Diah, she explained that she was not aware of any training activities held by the Dinkop, UKM, Perindag, City of Serang. Supposedly, following Serang City Regional Regulation Number 3 of 2015 part two article 59 (3) explains that business development by the community is at least carried out with technical and managerial guidance. Based on Table 8, it is known that the tofu producers who received the tofu development program were only 17 people out of the total number of tofu producers, Kel. Lopang as many as 35 people.

Table 8
Data of Recipients of IKM Training (Tofu Craftsmen in Lopang Village)

No	entrepreneur	Training	No	entrepreneur	Training
1	H.Enjang	Done	19	Ujang Saripudin	not yet
2	Jajang	Done	20	Suhandha	Done
3	Mutahudin	not yet	21	Aminah	Done
4	Suplana	not yet	22	Puloh	not yet
5	Darus	Done	23	Atep Sodikin	Done
6	Ratna	not yet	24	Agus Yusuf	not yet
7	Muslihudin	not yet	25	Ujang Hidayat	not yet
8	Sanwani	not yet	26	Pipin Supriana	Done
9	Hendi	Done	27	Nandang	Done
10	Wawan	Done	28	Mulyadi	not yet
11	Puloh	not yet	29	Endang Kusuma	Done
12	H. Ujang Elon	not yet	30	Ahyar	Done
13	H. Moch Sidik	not yet	31	Oneng Nurdin	Done
14	Sahidin	Done	32	Jeje	not yet
15	Dadang	not yet	33	Asep Sopian	Done
16	Tatang	Done	34	Ojang Yohana	Done
17	Ahmad Zamroni	Done	35	Engkon	Done
18	Jana Anggara	not yet			

Source: Koperasi Tahu dan Tempe Indonesia (KOPTI) Kota Serang (2022)

Second, it does not facilitate tofu craftsmen in terms of capital. The capital of the tofu craftsmen comes from personal money and has never received a capital loan from the Cooperative. When personal capital is lacking to pay employees and buy raw materials, craftsmen find it difficult. On the other hand, from the point of view of government funding, based on preliminary observations, researchers found that the community received assistance from the government that was not evenly distributed.

Third, not facilitating tofu craftsmen in Lopang Village in terms of promotion. There is no assistance using social media from the DinkopUKMPerindag City of Serang to support sales. The marketing strategy carried out by the DinkopUKMPerindag City of Serang is only at annual events such as the 2019 Serang Fair. Website The City Government of Serang and the City of Serang City Cooperative, UKMPerindag were not used as a means of promotion.

Based on the results of the explanation above, this article will analyze the Evaluation of the 2022 Small and Medium Industry Development Program (Case Study of Tofu Craftsmen in Lopang Village, Serang District, Serang City). The question that becomes the formulation of the problem in this research is how successful the Small and Medium Industry Development Program in 2022 (Case Study of Tofu Craftsmen in Lopang Village, Serang District, Serang City).

Public policy according to Dye (Tahir, 2020) is whatever the government chooses to do or not to do (Public policy is whatever governments choose to do or not to do). In this sense, the focus of public policy attention is not only on what the government does but also on what the government does not do. This is because "something not done" by the government will have the same influence as "something done by the government".

The process of public policy has a stage that is interrelated with one another. So, if one of these stages is missing, then of course it will affect the public policy itself. The following stages of public policy according to William Dunn (Anggara, 2014) include problem formulation (agenda setting), forecasting (policy formulation), recommendations (policy adoption), monitoring (monitoring), and assessment/evaluation (assessment policy).

Many experts define policy evaluation with different formulations, but there are similarities between public policy evaluation and program evaluation. Revealed by Wollmann (Fisher et al., 2007)

who stated that characteristically, policy (or program) evaluation has two tasks, namely. First, it produces an assessment of the extent to which the intended policy objectives have been achieved (goal achievement). Second, policy and program evaluations are also expected and mandated to answer the question (related) whether the observed effects and changes are really (related) to the policy or program concerned.

Program evaluation is a design activity that forms an interrelated system regarding program quality by involving more than one person in its implementation. Program Evaluation according to Stufflebeam (2003) must include 4 criteria, namely Context Evaluation, Input Evaluation, Process Evaluation, and Product Evaluation. First, Context Evaluation (Context); assess needs, problems and opportunities in the defined environment. This evaluation helps the evaluator to determine and assess the objectives and then refer to the assessed needs of the beneficiaries to assess the program. Second, Evaluation of Input (Input); assess the competitive strategy and work plan as well as the budget of the chosen approach for implementation.

Third, Process Evaluation (Process); monitor, document, and assess program activities. One of its goals is to provide feedback on how well staff are carrying out planned activities as planned and as efficiently as planned. Fourth, Evaluation of Results (Product); identify and assess short and long-term or desired and unwanted outcomes. The reason researchers use this theory is that the CIPP Model provides a detailed, clear, and broad picture of a program from its context to the implementation process.

B. METHOD

The research method used by researchers is descriptive qualitative. This study uses the types and sources of primary and secondary data. Data collection uses observation (interview), interviews, documentation, and document study. This research was conducted at the Office of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises, Industry and Trade (DinkopUKMPerindag) of Serang City and the location of Tofu craftsmen in Lopang Village, Serang City.

This research was conducted in Serang City, Banten Province. Informants in this study amounted to 11 people namely the Office of Cooperatives, SMEs, Industry and Trade (DinkopUKMPerindag) Serang City, Serang District MSME Assistants, Indonesian Tofu and Tempe Cooperative (KOPTI) Banten Province, tofu craftsmen in Lopang Village, academics, local people and tofu traders Loop Village. The researcher uses the data analysis model Miles and Huberman (Sugiyono, 2016), which states that activities in qualitative data analysis are carried out interactively and continuously until complete so that the data is saturated. To test the validity of the data, researchers used source triangulation and technique triangulation.

C. RESEARCH FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Context Evaluation Small and Medium Industries in Serang City

According to Stufflebeam (Stufflebeam, 2003), context evaluation determines and assesses the goals and then refers to the assessed needs of the beneficiaries. First, the agency has identified the targets of the small and medium industry development program, namely SMI in Serang City. Second, the DinkopUKMPerindag has identified target needs, namely it has held discussions with KOPTI Kota Serang.

Third, the SMI development program is not following the needs of tofu craftsmen in Lopang Village, because the program implementers did not solve the problem of the needs of tofu craftsmen in Lopang Village. Even though the Office of Cooperatives, UKM, Industry and Trade (DinkopUKMPerindag) already knows the needs of tofu craftsmen in Lopang Village by discussing with KOPTI Kota Serang, the program implementers did not solve the problem according to the target needs so they could not accommodate the needs of tofu craftsmen in Lopang Village, because the main needs of the craftsmen tofu are the commodity price of soybeans.

Media findings obtained by researchers that the most important need for tofu craftsmen to make tofu is the raw material, namely soybeans. The soybeans used come from importers of FKS Multi Agro. Indonesia's inability to produce soybeans for tofu and tempeh has caused tofu producers in Lopang Village to depend on imported soybeans. This can happen due to the lack of sunlight in Indonesia for

planting soybeans so the soybeans produced are shrinking or small. Meanwhile, it is difficult to obtain subsidized soybean raw materials. Therefore, the government should pay attention to the subsidized soybean policy (Ketua Kopti Banten: Pemprov Banten Tidak Punya Kebijakan Kedelai, 2023)

Irianto (Irianto, 2001) states that training activities include at least three stages, namely training needs analysis, training program implementation, and training evaluation. Based on this theory, before carrying out an activity, the Dinkop, UKM, Perindag City of Serang made a Training Need Analysis/Assessment for tofu craftsmen in the Lopang Village so that the activities carried out were following the needs of tofu producers that occurred in the field.

Fourth, the aim of implementing the small and medium industry program for tofu craftsmen is to increase the commodities of SMI actors both in terms of quality and quantity through development activities. In context, goals are the plans needed and implemented to achieve the desired results. In implementing the SMI development program, the planned objectives are also adjusted to Regional Regulation Number 3 of 2015 concerning the Empowerment and Development of Micro Enterprises as follows:

1. Realizing a regional economic structure that is balanced, developed and just;
2. Growing and developing the capabilities of Micro Enterprises, to become strong and independent businesses; And
3. Creating the role of micro-enterprises in regional development, creating jobs, equalizing income, economic growth, and alleviating people from poverty.

Based on the Terms of Reference (TOR) document for the SMI development program, the DinkopUKMPerindag City of Serang has the goal of increasing the commodities of SMI actors both in terms of quality and quantity. This goal is following Serang City Regional Regulation Number 3 of 2015 concerning Empowerment and Development of Micro Enterprises article 2 (c), namely to grow and develop the capabilities of micro-businesses, to become strong and independent businesses, and based on the results of interviews with informants, overall it can be concluded that the evaluation of the context is problematic because the DinkopUKMPerindag City of Serang did not solve the problem according to the needs of the tofu craftsmen in the Lopang Village.

Input Evaluation Small and Medium Industries in Serang City

Program input indicators can run well when the strategy and work plan are well structured, and there is sufficient budget available to support the implementation of tofu industry development activities. In terms of activity strategy, the City of Serang City Cooperative, UKMPerindag claims to have experienced staff in the industrial sector. Based on the results of the interviews that the researchers conducted, the resource persons at the food training in 2022 are non-PNS employees of the DinkopUKMPerindag City of Serang, who have a food business.

Then, the DinkopUKMPerindag City of Serang has collaborated with Bank BJB in terms of capital, the Department of Agriculture in terms of resource persons for training activities, UNTIRTA collaborated in preserving milkfish, the Investment and One-Stop Services Agency (DPMPTSP) collaborated in making NIB, the Office Banten Province Industry and the Ministry of Industry cooperate in terms of activity participant quotas per the needs of SMI. In addition, the industrial sector always collaborates with the MSME sector and the Trade sector at the DinkopUKMPerindag City of Serang. Cooperation with other parties is carried out to save on available budget expenses.

In terms of work plans, based on statements from several informants, it can be said that in terms of training work plans, it has been scheduled in the 2022 work plan document, while mentoring activities are carried out incidentally. In addition, there is a lack of clarity in written technical guidelines (juknis) and implementation instructions (juklak) in the SMI development program. This was conveyed by staff in the industrial sector that there is no written SOP in the SMI development program, there is only an implementation mechanism in the field. SMI can participate in all activities organized by DinkopUKMPerindag City of Serang with the condition that it has business legalization, namely Business Identification Number (NIB).

In the implementation mechanism in the field, there is a flow, namely: data collection, visits to SME locations and conveying complaints to superiors. For the socialization of the training, which was good enough, the Dinkop, UKM, Perindag City of Serang invited the training participants, including tofu craftsmen from Lopang Village, to use a letter by giving the invitation to the location concerned. The party responsible for sending letters to tofu craftsmen in the Lopang Sub-District is the accompanying staff for UMKM in the District of Serang, namely Mr Dedi. If there are obstacles, he

sends invitations via WhatsApp by contacting the participants one by one (personal line). The letter is only shown to KOPTI, to be handed over to KOPTI members who are interested in participating in the training.

Based on the Terms of Reference Document (TOR) for the SMI Development Program, there is only 1 activity with 2 training sub-activities, namely food training and training certification training. However, based on the statement of an informant accompanying UMKM in Serang District, it was revealed that tofu craftsmen in Lopang Village received market operations. The trading sector of the DinkopUKMPerindag is the sector that oversees market operations in the City of Serang.

The condition of human resources in the implementation of the SMI development program in Serang City can be seen in terms of the quantity and quality of the employees according to their respective fields and duties. However, according to the statements of several informants, it was revealed that there were no assistants in the small and medium industry development program for tofu craftsmen in Lopang Village. In addition, the researchers found a table of educational qualifications in the 2022 Work Plan Document for the DinkopUKMPerindag City of Serang, namely:

Table 9
The number of human resources with the suitability of education in the DinkoUKMPerindag City of Serang

<i>No.</i>	<i>Education</i>	<i>Total</i>
1.	Strata 2	13 orang
2.	Strata 1	19 orang
3.	D.III	1 orang
4.	SLTA	2 orang
5.	Non PNS	63 orang
	<i>Total</i>	98 orang

Source: Dinkop UKMPerindag Kota Serang (2022)

The table above explains that there is a gap between the number of PNS employees and non-PNS employees. PNS employees totalled 35 people while non-PNS employees totalled 63 people. This resulted in performance in the implementation of the SMI development program which was still lacking and did not match the competence with the tasks being carried out.

So far, tofu craftsmen in the Lopang Village have been fostered by the Serang District MSME Facilitators because the Lopang Village is included in the Serang District area. In the city of Serang, MSME assistants also serve as SMI assistants. It should be noted that the accompanying informant for MSMEs in Serang District is also a staff member in the industrial sector of the Dinkop, UKM, Perindag, City of Serang.

The budget sub-indicator assesses program evaluation based on the source of the budget used and the adequacy of the available budget for the SMI development program for tofu craftsmen in Lopang Village. First, regarding the source of the budget used. The budget for running the SMI development program comes from the Regional Revenue and Expenditure Budget (APBD) of Serang City. Second, related to the adequacy of the program budget. The budget used for the development of small and medium industries for tofu craftsmen is considered insufficient, while the needs of industry players, especially tofu craftsmen, are very large, ranging from production assistance such as equipment assistance to marketing such as digital marketing training which was held by the DinkopUKMPerindag City of Serang in the previous year.

The results of the study entitled Evaluation of the Development and Development Program for Small and Medium Industries in Ponorogo Regency revealed that the budget received had an impact on the number and duration of activities (Iskandar et al., 2017). In addition, the results of Sukatno's research (Sukatno, 2016) entitled Implementation of the Small Bag Industry Center Development Program in Petir District, limited budgetary resources are an obstacle in implementing the development of small bag industry centers in Serang Regency. With a limited budget allocation, efficient and effective planning is needed in determining what training is needed for SMI actors over the next year to meet the needs of SMI, especially the needs of tofu craftsmen in Lopang Village.

Process Evaluation Small and Medium Industries in Serang City

Stufflebeam (2003), process evaluation assesses the problems that exist in the process stage of the obstacles to the SMI development program for tofu craftsmen Kel. Lopang. In the sub-indicators of activity implementation, the DinkopUKMPerindag City of Serang has not conducted comprehensive training for SMI actors, especially in the tofu industry. Most of the tofu craftsmen in Lopang Village have not received training. This is because the participants who took part in the training were selected based on suggestions from the accompanying staff. So that participants in training activities are always with the same person. In addition, these trainings are rarely held, only 2-3 times a year and the training provided is not following the needs of SMI, especially tofu craftsmen, where the implementation of the training only contains material, even though many SMI actors can benefit from giving practice.

The sub-indicator of activity barriers assesses program evaluation based on the obstacles found during program implementation. Based on the results of research in the field, researchers found obstacles in the implementation of the Small and Medium Industry Development Program for tofu craftsmen in Lopang Village, namely: First, they are still constrained by a limited budget. Second, there are differences of opinion among officers. Differences of opinion between officers can be used as a medium to carry out improvements or changes in strategy to achieve the goals of an organization.

Third, based on the results of interviews with informants, the obstacles in the SMI development program are due to the policies of different superiors. The results of the study entitled *The Effect of Work Motivation, Work Discipline, Work Environment and Leadership Style on the Performance of Civil Servants at the Regional Industry and Trade Office of the Batam City Government* reveal that leadership style has a positive and significant effect on the performance of Employees at the Regional Industry and Trade Service of the Batam City Government (Kusumayanti et al., 2020). Leaders who provide enthusiasm or encouragement to their employees can contribute to effective and productive performance. In essence, the better the leadership, the better the performance.

Fourth, according to the results of the interviews that the researchers conducted, some informants said that there was no shortage of human resources in the small and medium industry development program for tofu craftsmen in Lopang Village. However, based on document studies, researchers found that there were no SMI assistants, so far MSME assistants have also served as SMI assistants. It is hoped that there will be additional MSME assistant staff or the procurement of SMI assistant staff so that resources for SMI assistance activities can run optimally.

Fifth, the lack of participation of tofu craftsmen to participate in training activities. This is due to the activities of tofu craftsmen who have to produce tofu and sell it. In addition, tofu craftsmen realized that the need for craftsmen was no longer training, but equipment assistance, so many tofu craftsmen were reluctant to attend training held by the DinkopUKMPerindag Kota Serang. The results of the thesis research entitled *Evaluation Of Implementation Of Small Medium Industrial Development Programs (Case Study of Pottery Small Industry Development in Bumi Jaya Village, Ciruas District, Serang Regency)*, the lack of enthusiasm of beneficiaries to take part in training is an obstacle to the success of a program (Putri, 2022).

Product Evaluation Small and Medium Industries in Serang City

Stufflebeam (Stufflebeam, 2003) explains that product evaluation assesses the extent to which the implemented program has been able to meet the needs of the group that uses it. Referring to the discussion of field data, it is known that the implementation of the tofu industry development program in the Lopang Sub-District on activity outcome indicators is not following the CIPP theory. With the training activities, there was a change in the packaging of tofu products, namely using mica and plastic boxes. In addition, with the assistance provided by the DinkopUKMPerindag City of Serang, all tofu craftsmen in the Lopang Village already have a Business Identification Number (NIB). Regarding halal certification, only 10 tofu producers in Lopang Village already have halal certification.

Based on the results of interviews with informants, overall it can be concluded that product evaluation is problematic because the objectives of the development program have not succeeded in increasing the quality and quantity of tofu products. It only causes changes in tofu product packaging, obtains halal certification, and has a NIB.

D. CONCLUSION

Results of the research and discussion that the researchers have described above, it can be concluded that the Evaluation of the 2022 Small and Medium Industry Development Program in Serang Banten has not fully achieved the objectives of the program. This is assessed based on the components in the CIPP program evaluation model proposed by Stufflebeam (2003) which can be detailed as follows:

1. The context dimension has not gone well because the DinkopUKMPerindag City of Serang did not fix the problem according to the needs of tofu craftsmen in Lopang Village
2. The input dimension has not gone well in the scheduling aspect of mentoring activities because it is still carried out accidentally. However, other indicators have been implemented, which include budgets, activity strategies, and training work plans.
3. In the Process dimension, there are still obstacles, namely limited budget constraints, differences of opinion between officers, different superior policies, shortage of SMI assistants, and lack of participation of tofu craftsmen in Lopang Village to attend training.
4. Product Dimensions stated that it was not good enough because it had not achieved the program objectives, namely increasing the quality and quantity of products.

REFERENCE

- Anggara, S. (2014). Kebijakan Publik. In *Pustaka Setia Bandung*.
<https://medium.com/@arifwicaksanaa/pengertian-use-case-a7e576e1b6bf>
- Fisher, F., Miller, G. J., & Sidney, M. S. (2007). Handbook of Public Policy. In *Reference Reviews* (Vol. 21, Nomor 8). CRC Press. <https://doi.org/10.1108/09504120710838741>
- Irianto, J. (2001). Prinsip-prinsip dasar manajemen pelatihan. In *Kajian Mandiri Pelatihan dan Pengembangan SDM. Insan Cendikia*.
http://file.upi.edu/Direktori/FIP/JUR._PEND._LUAR_BIASA/195603221982031-DEDY_KURNIADI/ULASAN/Pelatihan_Kajian_Mandiri.pdf
- Iskandar, D. T., Sumartono, S., & Domai, T. (2017). Evaluasi Program Pembinaan Dan Pengembangan Industri Kecil Dan Menengah Di Kabupaten Ponorogo. *JPSI (Journal of Public Sector Innovations)*, 1(1), 17. <https://doi.org/10.26740/jpsi.v1n1.p17-22>
- Ketua Kopti Banten: Pemprov Banten Tidak Punya Kebijakan Kedelai.* (2023). BANTENPodcast.
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=2coannWJVp8>
- Kusumayanti, K., Ratnasari, S. L., & Hakim, L. (2020). Pengaruh Motivasi Kerja, Disiplin Kerja, Lingkungan Kerja, Dan Gaya Kepemimpinan Terhadap Kinerja Pegawai Negeri Sipil Dinas Perindustrian Dan Perdagangan Daerah Pemerintah Kota Batam. *Jurnal Bening*, 7(2), 178–192.
<https://www.journal.unrika.ac.id/index.php/beningjournal/article/view/2445>
- Maharani, E. R. (2022). DAMPAK PEMBANGUNAN SENTRA IKM MENGGUNAKAN DANA ALOKASI KHUSUS (DAK) TERHADAP BANYAKNYA INDUSTRI KECIL MENENGAH DI INDONESIA. 2, 238–255.
- Putri, Y. P. (2022). EVALUASI IMPLEMENTASI PROGRAM PENGEMBANGAN INDUSTRI KECIL MENENGAH (Studi Kasus Pengembangan Industri Kecil Gerabah Desa Bumi Jaya Kecamatan Ciruas Kabupaten Serang) [Universitas Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa].
[https://eprints.untirta.ac.id/18108/2/Yoan Priscilla Putri_6661180148_FULL TEXT.pdf](https://eprints.untirta.ac.id/18108/2/Yoan%20Priscilla%20Putri_6661180148_FULL%20TEXT.pdf)
- Rata-rata Konsumsi Perkapita Seminggu Menurut Kelompok Kacang-Kacangan Per Kabupaten/kota (Satuan Komoditas). (2022). Badan Pusat Statistik. <https://www.bps.go.id/indicator/5/2101/1/rata-rata-konsumsi-perkapita-seminggu-menurut-kelompok-kacang-kacangan-per-kabupaten-kota.html>
- Rata-rata Konsumsi Perkapita Seminggu Menurut Kelompok Makanan dan Minuman Jadi Per Kabupaten/kota (Satuan Komoditas). (2022). Badan Pusat Statistik.

<https://www.bps.go.id/indicator/5/2107/1/rata-rata-konsumsi-perkapita-seminggu-menurut-kelompok-makanan-dan-minuman-jadi-per-kabupaten-kota.html>

Stufflebeam, D. L. (2003). The CIPP Model for Evaluation. *International Handbook of Educational Evaluation*, 31-62. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-010-0309-4_4

Sugiyono. (2016). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D*. CV Alfabeta.

Sukatno. (2016). *Implementasi Program Pengembangan Sentra Industri Kecil Kabupaten Serang (Studi Kasus : Pengembangan Sentra Industri Kecil Tas di Kecamatan Petir)* (Nomor September) [Universitas Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa]. [http://eprints.untirta.ac.id/758/%0Ahttp://eprints.untirta.ac.id/758/1/COVER-LAMPIRAN - Copy.pdf](http://eprints.untirta.ac.id/758/%0Ahttp://eprints.untirta.ac.id/758/1/COVER-LAMPIRAN-Copy.pdf)

Sulistiyo, H., & Putra, R. A. K. (2020). Strategi Pengembangan Usaha Kecil Menengah Sektor Industri Pengolahan Kabupaten Bekasi. *Jurnal Ekonomi dan Bisnis*, 7(1).

Tahir, A. (2020). *Kebijakan Publik dan Good Governancy*. <https://repository.ung.ac.id/karyailmiah/show/6523/arifin-tahir-kebijakan-publik-dan-good-governancy.html>